# WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

#### Present-

Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Chairman. & Hon'ble Dr. Subesh Kumar Das, Administrative Member.

CASE No.MA 19 of 2013, MA 31 of 2017 & MA 32 of 2017(OA 418 of 2010). SRI NARAYAN CHANDRA DEY -Vs- THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

| SRI NARAYAN CHANDRA DEY -Vs- THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS. |   |   |  |
|---|---|---|--|
| Serial No. and  | Order of the Tribunal with signature                                    | Office action with date and dated signature |  |
| Date of order.  | 2   | of parties when necessary                   |  |
| 1   |   | 3   |  |
|   |   |   |  |
|   | For the Applicant : Mrs. K. Chatterjee,                                 |   |  |
| 12.2.2019.  | Mr. D. Chatterjee,  |   |  |
|   | Advocates.  |   |  |
|   | Facility Class Bassack and Alexander Advices Bassack                    |   |  |
|   | For the State Respondent : Mr. G.P. Banerjee,                           |   |  |
|   | Advocate.   |   |  |
|   | By consent of Mrs. K. Chatterjee appearing                              |   |  |
|   | along with Mr. D. Chatterjee, learned advocates for the                 |   |  |
|   | applicant and Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learned advocate for the               |   |  |
|   | state respondent, the miscellaneous application being                   |   |  |
|   | MA 19 of 2013, is treated as on day's list and is taken up              |   |  |
|   | for hearing along with MA 31 of 2017 and MA 32 of 2017                  |   |  |
|   | as well as OA 418 of 2010.  |   |  |
|   | MA 19 of 2013 has been filed for recalling the                          |   |  |
|   | order dated 20 <sup>th</sup> December, 2010 by which the original       |   |  |
|   | application was dismissed for non prosecution as the                    |   |  |
|   | applicant was found absent. Since the applicant was                     |   |  |
|   | absent, by order dated 9 <sup>th</sup> July, 2013, the said application |   |  |
|   | being MA 19 of 2013 was dismissed for default.                          |   |  |
|   | Thereafter, the applicant had filed another miscellaneous               |   |  |
|   | application being MA 32 of 2017 for recalling the order                 |   |  |
|   | dated 9 <sup>th</sup> July, 2013 along with an application for          |   |  |
|   | condoning the delay, being MA 31 of 2017, in moving the                 |   |  |
|   |   | i .   |  |

|          | SRI NARAYAN CHANDRA DEY. |
|----------|--------------------------|
| Form No. | ••••                     |
|          | Vs.                      |

Case No. MA 19 of 2013, MA 31 of 2017 & MA 32 of 2017(OA 418 of 2010). THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order.<br>1 | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2                              | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessar |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|
|                                       | application being MA 32 of 2017.                                       |  |
|                                       | The application being MA 31 of 2017 has                                |  |
|                                       | been filed for condoning the delay in filing the application           |  |
|                                       | for restoration. Heard Mrs. Chatterjee and Mr. Banerjee,               |  |
|                                       | learned advocates for the parties. Causes shown for                    |  |
|                                       | condoning the delay are sufficient. Therefore, delay in                |  |
|                                       | moving the application, being MA 32 of 2017 is                         |  |
|                                       | condoned. Hence, the miscellaneous application being                   |  |
|                                       | MA 31 of 2017, is allowed.   |  |
|                                       | The application being MA 32 of 2017 is taken                           |  |
|                                       | up for hearing. Perused the application being MA 32 of                 |  |
|                                       | 2017 for recalling the order dated 9 <sup>th</sup> July, 2013 by which |  |
|                                       | the miscellaneous application was dismissed for default.               |  |
|                                       | Causes shown are sufficient. Therefore the order dated                 |  |
|                                       | 9 <sup>th</sup> July, 2013 is recalled.                                |  |
|                                       | The application, being MA 19 of 2013 is                                |  |
|                                       | taken up for hearing. Perused the recalling order dated                |  |
|                                       | 20 <sup>th</sup> December, 2010 by which the original application      |  |
|                                       | was dismissed for non appearance of the parties. Causes                |  |
|                                       | shown are sufficient. Therefore the order dated 20 <sup>th</sup>       |  |
|                                       | December, 2010 is recalled. The application being M.A.                 |  |
|                                       | No. 19 of 2013 is allowed. The application being OA No.                |  |

|          | SRI NARAYAN CHANDRA DEY. |
|----------|--------------------------|
| Form No. | ••••                     |
|          | Vs.                      |

Case No. MA 19 of 2013, MA 31 of 2017 & MA 32 of 2017(OA 418 of 2010). THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order.<br>1 | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2                          | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary |
|---------------------------------------|--|---|
|                                       | 418 of 2010 is restored to its file and number.                    |   |
|                                       | The application being O.A. No. 418 of 2010 is                      |   |
|                                       | taken up for hearing.  |   |
|                                       | Heard Mrs. Chatterjee and Mr. Banerjee,                            |   |
|                                       | learned advocates for the parties.                                 |   |
|                                       | In this application, the applicant is the                          |   |
|                                       | younger brother of Niva Dey, who was an employee of                |   |
|                                       | Health & Family Welfare Department. She was last                   |   |
|                                       | posted at Basirhat Sub Division hospital as A.N.M. She             |   |
|                                       | was unmarried and had expired on 1 <sup>st</sup> May, 2006. Before |   |
|                                       | the death of Niva Dey her parents had expired. In this             |   |
|                                       | application the applicant has sought for disbursing of             |   |
|                                       | death benefit of Niva Dey. Prayer has also been made for           |   |
|                                       | granting of family pension.  |   |
|                                       | Mrs. Chatterjee appearing on behalf of the                         |   |
|                                       | applicant submits that since the applicant is entitled to          |   |
|                                       | family pension, appropriate order may be passed.                   |   |
|                                       | Moreover, direction may be issued on the respondents to            |   |
|                                       | disburse the amount as mentioned in the succession                 |   |
|                                       | certificate, which has been annexed to the application.            |   |
|                                       | Mr. Banerjee, appearing on behalf of the                           |   |
|                                       | State respondent submits that under the law the brother            |   |

| Form No. |     |  |
|----------|-----|--|
|          | Vs. |  |

Case No. MA 19 of 2013, MA 31 of 2017 & MA 32 of 2017(OA 418 of 2010). THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order.<br>1 | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2                | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessar |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|
|                                       | of the deceased is not entitled to family pension        | n.   |
|                                       | Moreover, under the law the Tribunal cannot be treate    | d  |
|                                       | to be a forum for executing the directions contained i   | n  |
|                                       | the succession certificate.                              |  |
|                                       | Heard learned advocates for the partie                   | S.   |
|                                       | Nothing has been shown how the applicant has acquire     | d  |
|                                       | the right to receive the death benefits of Niva De       | y.   |
|                                       | Moreover this Court cannot be treated to be an executing | g  |
|                                       | Court for implementing the directions in the successio   | n  |
|                                       | certificate. Therefore, no order is passed on th         | is   |
|                                       | application. The O.A. 418 of 2010 is dismissed.          |  |
|                                       | (Subesh Kumar Das) (Soumitra Pal)  Member(A). Chairman.  |  |
| Skg.                                  |  |  |

|          | SRI NARAYAN CHANDRA DEY. |
|----------|--------------------------|
| Form No. |                          |
|          | Vs.                      |

Case No. MA 19 of 2013, MA 31 of 2017 & MA 32 of 2017(OA 418 of 2010). THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

.....

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order. | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2 | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary |
|----------------------------------|---|---|
| 1                                |   | 3   |